

Sustainability Study – Millville Elementary School Financial Considerations

In order to do some financial comparisons, we need to consider the “What If” scenarios that would be most likely if the District Education Council voted in favor of closing Millville Elementary School and the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Development approved the movement of students to another location. The “What If” scenarios for this particular study are:

- A) Move students from Millville Elementary School to Nackawic Elementary School, maintaining a K-5 school configuration.
- B) Move students from Millville Elementary School to Nackawic Middle School, forming a new K-8 school configuration with the students from Millville Elementary School, Nackawic Elementary School and Nackawic Middle School.

Staffing Information and Implications

- Teacher staffing is conducted based on a series of formulas that are related to student enrolment.
- In reviewing the numbers to assign staff for 2015-16, we used enrollment from the Spring of 2015.
- Classroom FTE (Full Time Equivalent; number of teachers) is assigned by formula, knowing that there is a maximum class size for classrooms as indicated in the Teacher’s Collective Agreement
 - 1.1 FTE per classroom at the elementary level
 - 1.2 FTE per classroom at the middle level
 - 1.0 FTE per 12.4 students for first 100 at high school level (minimum 5.0 FTE)
 - 1.0 FTE per 19.7 students for next 300 at high school level
- Guidance FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 502 students (topped up where it can be).
- Resource FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 180 students (topped up where it can be).
- Administration FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 275 students (topped up where it can be).
- The number of school administrators is assigned according to the number of teachers; 1 principal is provided to a school with less than 12.6 FTE, 1 principal and 1 vice-principal is provided to a school with 12.6 FTE or more, but less than 37.6 FTE.
- Top-ups in FTE are assessed year to year.
- Education Assistants are assigned based on need and on an annual basis.
- Library Assistants are assigned based on a formula of 1.0 per 870 students; it is based on a 36.25 hour work week, so part time library assistants are most common (there are times when a public library is within the school and a Library Assistant is not under Education).

- Administrative Assistants are assigned at a minimum of one full-time per school (36.25 hours per week), with top-up for larger schools. One full-time administrative assistant works 12 months per year at each high school setting. The remainder work 10 months per year.
- Custodial Staff are assigned based on square footage of the facility.
- All staff are paid based on scales within their collective agreements.
- Principals and vice-principals are paid a responsibility allowance (based on enrolment and years of experience in the position).
- Please see Appendix A for data on staff.
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario A:
 - \$13 259 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
 - \$149 487 due to 2.2 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
 - \$33 736 due to 1.0 less administrative assistant, including employer costs
 - \$26 802 due to 0.65 less custodian, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario A is **\$223 284**
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario B:
 - \$21 011 due to two less principals at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs and taking into account resulting medium sized school
 - \$149 487 due to 2.2 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
 - \$50 881 due to 1.59 less administrative assistant, including employer costs
 - \$85 250 due to 2.1 less custodian, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario B is **\$306 629**

Global School Budgets and Operational Facility Budgets

- Global school budgets and Operational Facility Budgets are assigned on an annual basis according to a number of different formulas. Enrolment is often a key factor. They are used to support student learning and operate the facility.
- Since amalgamation, we have adjusted school budgets to ensure that significant decreases do not occur all at once, if a decrease is required; we ensure that any budget reductions do not go further than 2.5% (likewise, if it grows, we cap at 2.5%). If this were not to be in place, the global budgets based on our enrolment and formulas would have yielded a variety of different amounts:

- Millville Elementary School would have had a decrease of 44% and they ended up with a decrease of only 2.5%
 - Nackawic Elementary School would have had an increase of 11% and they ended up with an increase of 2.4% (after adjustments made for all schools).
 - Nackawic Middle School would have had a decrease of 16% and they ended up with a decrease of only 2.5%
- Please see Appendix B for details on global school budgets and facility operational budgets for potential annual savings; this is data as projected by our Budget and Accounting Team.
 - Total annual savings from global school budgets and facility operational budgets are:
 - Scenario A – \$31 448
 - Scenario B - \$116 497

Transportation Costs

Scenario A & B would see the reduction of the two current bus runs in the Millville Elementary School catchment area for Millville Elementary School. This would give rise to an approximate annual savings of \$17 000.

Capital Improvement Avoidance

- Schools have a number of projects listed on the Capital Improvement Project database. Each year, a number of projects are prioritized and submitted to government for approval.
- If a school were to close, the projects would then not be necessary and be removed from the list for consideration.
- Projects vary in terms of priority/need; some are necessary in a timely manner and some are not; some projects may be for aesthetic improvement as well.
- Estimates for projects are based on formulas and historic costs – they are estimates and not actual quotes; the Department of Education and Early Childhood Development and the Department of Transportation and Infrastructure are involved in capital construction projects.

- The capital improvements currently on the list for Millville Elementary School include:
 - Roof replacement work
 - Siding replacement
 - Paving
 - Some window replacement
 - Wheel chair lift and automatic door openers
 - Floor replacements
 - Office relocation
 - Intercom System upgrades
 - Backflow prevention for water supply and distribution
 - Electrical panel upgrades
 - Ventilation system and electrical upgrade

- These projects amount to approximately \$836 900.

- The capital improvements currently on the list for Nackawic Elementary School include:
 - Installing automatic door openers on the exterior doors (accessibility)
 - Some window replacements
 - An upgrading to the bus/parent drop off zone at the rear of the building
 - Electrical transformer cleaning

- These projects amount to approximately \$280 000.

Facility Improvements Required Should a Move Occur

It is recognized that should Scenario A occur, there would be minimal facility changes needed as Nackawic Elementary School is currently suited for elementary students (whether Millville Elementary School students are there or not). Should Scenario B occur, then there will need to be an investment made into Nackawic Middle School that would host new elementary students.

Scenario B

The middle school would require some modifications to support the elementary students. The middle school presently has 17 classroom spaces. The middle school classes would require 7 spaces next year and the elementary school classes would require 12 spaces. This would represent the need for an additional 2 spaces as classrooms. The cost of this could vary depending on if we could use other rooms within the school (not defined as a classroom) (minimal cost), dividing a larger classroom into two (\$3 500) per room, or adding one modular classroom (\$120 000) or two modular classrooms (\$135 000).

Modifications to consider for the existing school would be:

- Water fountain and washroom modifications – lower the water fountains to accommodate K-5 students and adjust the urinals in the male washrooms. (minimal, perhaps \$2 500 if improvements made)

- Smartboards may need to be lowered or installed at a height appropriate for K-1 grade levels. (minimal costs to lower existing units)

- Removal of the lockers and install coat hooks (\$24 000 for coat and boot racks as per DTI/EECD guidelines)
- Gym basketball nets – change out the backboards to accommodate lowering for elementary level (\$3 600)
- Relocation of smartboards, fm systems, would be coming from the existing school (could carry \$3 600 for \$300/classroom for connections and installation costs)
- Relocation of existing school furniture and resource materials (\$5 000)

Playground consideration: the equipment at Nackawic Elementary has been in the ground for at least 15 years. The manufacturer does not appear to be in business any longer. With this being said and from the experiences we have recently had it is not recommended that the playground be considered for relocation. Experience would show that it is possible the posts, platforms, slides and brackets will not fit when putting it back together. It is possible during the demolition of the existing playground that some pieces will break or be damaged and it is not possible to get the replacement parts. Once the equipment is relocated it is necessary to have it meet the current CSA standard. It is likely that new playground equipment would be required. This cost is minimally \$80 000 (the amount assigned by the Province when a new school is constructed), and could be more based on the desires of the school community. Playground equipment purchases traditionally come from fundraising (outside a new school allotment). It is unknown if playground equipment would be moved from Millville Elementary School.

TOTAL ANNUAL SAVINGS

- SCENARIO A – \$271 732 (Millville Elementary School closes and students go to Nackawic Elementary School)
- SCENARIO B - \$440 126 (Millville Elementary School and Nackawic Elementary School both close and students go to Nackawic Middle School as a reconfigured K-8 school)

ONE-TIME COST AVOIDANCE

- SCENARIO A - \$836 900 (because Millville Elementary School as a building would close)
- SCENARIO C - \$1 116 900 (because Nackawic Elementary School and Millville Elementary School would both close)

ONE-TIME EXPENSES

- SCENARIO A - \$0
- SCENARIO B – \$118 700 (without a modular classroom) to \$253 700 (with two modular classrooms)

NOTE: A permanent expansion to the middle school would cost several hundred thousand dollars more

- Please note: A principal and vice-principal is hired for a five year term. Should a school close and the principal and/or vice-principal not retire, resign or assume another school position of responsibility within the district, the employee continues to earn the responsibility allowance with the new assignment for the remainder of his or her five year term. The expectation is that the employee will still contribute in a leadership capacity within the new assignment. The future assignment for the principal of this particular school is not be known at this time of the study.

Appendix A

Grades - Enrollment	K	1	2	3	4	5	3EFI	4EFI	5EFI	6	7	8	6EFI	7EFI	8EFI	6LFI	7LFI	8LFI	Total	
2015-16																				
Millville Elementary School (MES)	1	4	3	9	7	5														29
Nackawic Elementary School (NES)	24	38	41	15	16	15	17	21	21	24	29	27	13	13	20	14	0	7		208
Nackawic Middle School (NMS)																				147
2016-17 Projections																				
Millville Elementary School	4	1	4	3	9	7														28
Nackawic Elementary School	31	24	38	19	15	16	22	17	21	20	24	29	21	13	13	0	14	0		203
Nackawic Middle School																				134
2016-17 Projections - Scenarios A and B																				
Nackawic Elementary School (with MES)	35	25	42	22	24	23	22	17	21	20	24	29	21	13	13	0	14	0		231
Nackawic K-8 School (with NES and MES)	35	25	42	22	24	23	22	17	21	20	24	29	21	13	13	0	14	0		365

2 Kindergarten Registered to date
26 Kindergarten Registered to date - Revised K Projection

	K-5 FTE	6-8 FTE	9-12 FTE	Admin	Guide	Res	Total FTE	Actl FTE	Fct Cpy	EA	LA	AA	Clean
2015-16													
Millville Elementary School	3.30			0.11	0.06	0.16	3.63	4.00	30.2	0.00	0.06	1.00	0.65
Nackawic Elementary School	13.20			0.76	0.41	1.16	15.53	15.40	66.7	3.00	0.24	1.00	2.20
Nackawic Middle School		9.60		0.53	0.29	0.82	11.24	11.20	29.8	5.00	0.16	1.00	2.50
2016-17 Projections													
Millville Elementary School	3.30			0.10	0.06	0.16	3.62		29.2	0.00	0.03	1.00	0.65
Nackawic Elementary School	12.10			0.74	0.40	1.13	14.37		65.1	3.00	0.23	1.00	2.20
Nackawic Middle School		8.40		0.49	0.27	0.74	9.90		27.2	5.00	0.15	1.00	2.50
2016-17 Projections - Scenarios A and B													
Nackawic Elementary School (with MES)	13.2	8.4		0.84	0.46	1.28	15.78		74.0	3.00	0.27	1.00	2.20
Nackawic K-8 School (with NES and MES)	13.2	8.4		1.33	0.73	2.03	25.69		82.6	8.00	0.42	1.41	3.25

FTE = Full Time Equivalent
Admin = Administration
Guide = Guidance
Res = Resource
Actl FTE = Actual FTE Assigned
Fct Cpy = Functional Capacity
EA = Educational Assistant
LA = Library Assistant
AA = Administrative Assistant
Clean = Cleaning Staff

Classroom Projection FTE changed from original Nackawic Report due to up-to-date Kindergarten registration

Estimated Cost Summary Based on Scenarios

2015-16

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Millville Elementary	8,857.52	33,416.00	42,273.52
Nackawic Elementary	25,778.78	89,021.00	114,799.78
Nackawic Middle	18,842.58	109,706.00	128,548.58
TOTAL	53,478.88	232,143.00	285,621.88

2016-17 Scenario Status Quo

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Millville Elementary	8,636.08	33,537.00	42,173.08
Nackawic Elementary	25,945.19	89,049.00	114,994.19
Nackawic Middle	18,371.51	109,716.00	128,087.51
TOTAL	52,952.78	232,302.00	285,254.78

2016-17 Scenario A

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Millville/Nackawic Elementary combined	33,770.39	91,949.00	125,719.39
Nackawic Middle	18,371.51	109,716.00	128,087.51
TOTAL	52,141.90	201,665.00	253,806.90

2016-17 Scenario B

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Nackawic K-8 (with MES and NES)	52,141.91	116,616.00	168,757.91
TOTAL	52,141.91	116,616.00	168,757.91

School Budget and Facilities Cost Scenarios

2015-16 Budget

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Millville Elementary	6,440.72	1,589.27	334.58	122.03	370.92	8,857.52
Nackawic Elementary	17,752.54	4,380.50	922.21	674.21	2,049.32	25,778.78
Nackawic Middle	14,184.62	3,500.10	736.86	421.00	-	18,842.58

2016-17 Budget Scenario Status Quo

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Millville Elementary	6,371.17	1,572.11	330.97	89.94	271.89	8,636.08
Nackawic Elementary	17,979.45	4,436.49	934.00	645.12	1,950.13	25,945.19
Nackawic Middle	13,795.01	3,403.96	716.62	455.92	-	18,371.51

2016-17 Budget Scenario A

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Millville/Nackawic Elementary combined	23,726.25	5,854.53	1,232.53	735.06	2,222.02	33,770.39
Nackawic Middle	13,795.01	3,403.96	716.62	455.92	-	18,371.51

2016-17 Budget Scenario B

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Nackawic Middle (with MES and NES included)	37,521.26	9,258.49	1,949.16	1,190.98	2,222.02	52,141.91

2015-16 Facilities Costs Estimates

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Millville Elementary	4,578.00	-	2,412.00	7,725.00	12,544.00	1,375.00	4,782.00	33,416.00
Nackawic Elementary	56,951.00	12,576.00	3,428.00	8,021.00	-	2,814.00	5,231.00	89,021.00
Nackawic Middle	77,132.00	10,928.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	1,467.00	7,763.00	109,706.00

2016-17 Facilities Costs Estimates-Status Quo

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Millville Elementary	4,600.00	-	2,412.00	7,725.00	12,600.00	1,400.00	4,800.00	33,537.00
Nackawic Elementary	57,000.00	12,600.00	3,428.00	8,021.00	-	2,800.00	5,200.00	89,049.00
Nackawic Middle	77,000.00	11,000.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	1,500.00	7,800.00	109,716.00

2016-17 Facilities Costs Estimates-Scenario A

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Millville/Nackawic Elementary combined	59,000.00	13,000.00	3,428.00	8,021.00	-	3,000.00	5,500.00	91,949.00
Nackawic Middle	77,000.00	11,000.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	1,500.00	7,800.00	109,716.00

2016-17 Facilities Costs Estimates-Scenario B

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Nackawic Middle (with MES and NES included)	80,500.00	12,200.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	2,600.00	8,900.00	116,616.00